

# Proposal Tabulation Form (CM at Risk Contract)

## State of Ohio Standard Forms and Documents

Project Number: SFC-160399  
 Project Name: Carrollton EVSD  
 Estimated Cost of Work: \$36,483,213

Proposer I: Shook Touchstone \*  
 Proposer II: ICON Construction  
 Proposer III: Knoch Regency

### A. Technical Proposal Evaluation (100 points maximum before weighting)

Qualifications Criteria	Range	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
1. Proposed Staffing	0 - 20	16.75	17.00	12.50
2. Subcontracting Plan	0 - 10	8.25	8.25	5.75
3. EDGE Plan	0 - 5	3.50	4.00	3.75
4. Estimating Strategies	0 - 10	8.00	7.50	7.50
5. Procurement Strategies	0 - 10	8.25	8.00	6.25
6. Value Added Suggestions	0 - 5	4.25	3.75	3.25
7. Timeline	0 - 20	17.75	17.00	14.00
8. Site Logistics & Safety Plan	0 - 10	9.00	8.50	6.75
9. Quality Assurance / Control Plan	0 - 5	4.00	3.75	2.75
10. Unique Challenges & Solutions	0 - 5	3.75	3.75	3.50
<b>Total Qualifications Score</b>		<b>83.50</b>	<b>81.50</b>	<b>66.00</b>
<b>Weight</b>				
<b>Subtotal (A)</b>	<b>55%</b>	<b>45.9</b>	<b>44.8</b>	<b>36.3</b>

### B. Pricing Proposal Analysis (100 points maximum before weighting)

Compensation Component	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
1.a. Preconstruction Stage Fee	5,000	0	20,000
1.b. Preconstruction Stage Personnel Costs	133,850	139,332	103,310
1.c. Preconstruction Stage Reimbursable Expenses	2,500	4,200	3,770
2.a. Construction Stage Personnel Costs	797,650	906,416	1,050,998
2.b. General Conditions Costs	361,500	454,313	545,950
2.c. CM's Fee (at Risk Services)	901,865	934,882	747,906
2.d. Owner Accepted Schedule Enhancements (+/-)			
3.a. Guaranteed Maximum Price (if requested)			
<b>Total Price Proposal</b>	<b>\$2,202,365</b>	<b>\$2,439,143</b>	<b>\$2,471,934</b>
4.a. CM Adviser Fee (Advisory Services only)	820,872	729,664	729,664
4.b. CM's Contingency	1,094,496	912,080	912,080
5.a. Proposed price from this CM team [ x ]	2,202,365	2,439,143	2,471,934
5.b. Lowest proposed price from all CM teams [ L ]	2,202,365	2,202,365	2,202,365
<b>Normalized Price Ranking = [1 - ((x - L) / L)] * 100</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>89.2</b>	<b>87.8</b>
<b>Weight</b>			
<b>Subtotal (B)</b>	<b>45.0</b>	<b>40.2</b>	<b>39.5</b>

### C. Approvals and Best Value Score (A + B)

	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
Selection Coordinator: _____			
Contracting Authority: _____	<b>90.9</b>	<b>85.0</b>	<b>75.8</b>