

Proposal Tabulation Form (CM at Risk Contract)

State of Ohio Standard Forms and Documents

Project Number: SFC-160403
 Project Name: Clear Fork Valley LSD
 Estimated Cost of Work: \$25,099,419

Proposer I: Regency Construction Services
 Proposer II: Ruscilli Construction Company
 Proposer III: Gilbane/Adena *

A. Technical Proposal Evaluation (100 points maximum before weighting)

Qualifications Criteria	Range	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
1. Proposed Staffing	0 - 20	12.50	15.25	18.25
2. Subcontracting Plan	0 - 10	5.50	7.00	9.00
3. EDGE Plan	0 - 5	3.25	3.25	4.00
4. Estimating Strategies	0 - 10	5.00	7.50	8.00
5. Procurement Strategies	0 - 10	5.50	6.50	8.50
6. Value Added Suggestions	0 - 5	2.75	3.75	3.75
7. Timeline	0 - 20	11.75	15.00	17.75
8. Site Logistics & Safety Plan	0 - 10	5.50	7.25	8.25
9. Quality Assurance / Control Plan	0 - 5	3.00	3.50	4.50
10. Unique Challenges & Solutions	0 - 5	2.75	4.25	4.00
Total Qualifications Score		57.50	73.25	86.00
Weight				
Subtotal (A)	55%	31.6	40.3	47.3

B. Pricing Proposal Analysis (100 points maximum before weighting)

Compensation Component	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
1.a. Preconstruction Stage Fee	5,000	5,000	15,000
1.b. Preconstruction Stage Personnel Costs	90,010	102,628	94,751
1.c. Preconstruction Stage Reimbursable Expenses	1,998	6,100	6,050
2.a. Construction Stage Personnel Costs	800,741	900,817	733,738
2.b. General Conditions Costs	482,152	330,953	379,370
2.c. CM's Fee (at Risk Services)	514,538	576,032	733,217
2.d. Owner Accepted Schedule Enhancements (+/-)			
3.a. Guaranteed Maximum Price (if requested)			
Total Price Proposal	\$1,894,439	\$1,921,530	\$1,962,126
4.a. CM Adviser Fee (Advisory Services only)	501,988	501,988	627,485
4.b. CM's Contingency	627,485	501,988	627,485
5.a. Proposed price from this CM team [x]	1,894,439	1,921,530	1,962,126
5.b. Lowest proposed price from all CM teams [L]	1,894,439	1,894,439	1,894,439
Normalized Price Ranking = [1 - ((x - L) / L)] * 100	100.0	98.6	96.4
Weight			
Subtotal (B)	45.0	44.4	43.4

C. Approvals and Best Value Score (A + B)

	Proposer I	Proposer II	Proposer III
Selection Coordinator: _____			
Contracting Authority: _____	76.6	84.7	90.7